

# High dimensional statistics

## Part 2: Shrinkage and Stein's phenomenon

---

Hugo Richard (research.hugo.richard@gmail.com)

ENPC - February 2022

# Introduction

## Gaussian sequence model

Observe one sample  $\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ ,  $\mathbf{y} \sim \mathcal{N}(\mu, \sigma^2 I_n)$ .

How to estimate the mean  $\mu$  ?

# Introduction

## Gaussian sequence model

Observe one sample  $\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ ,  $\mathbf{y} \sim \mathcal{N}(\mu, \sigma^2 I_n)$ .

How to estimate the mean  $\mu$  ?

## Example (Practical instance)

### Tasks

Proportion of people that vote Trump? ( $\mu_1$ )

Proportion of people with blue eyes in France? ( $\mu_2$ )

Proportion of new baby girls in Congo? ( $\mu_3$ )

### Observations

Result of a poll in New York ( $y_1$ )

Proportion of people with blue eyes in Paris ( $y_2$ )

Proportion of new baby girls in Brazaville ( $y_3$ )

# Introduction

## Gaussian sequence model

Observe one sample  $\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ ,  $\mathbf{y} \sim \mathcal{N}(\mu, \sigma^2 I_n)$ .

How to estimate the mean  $\mu$  ?

## Example (Maximum likelihood solution)

# Introduction

## Gaussian sequence model

Observe one sample  $\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ ,  $\mathbf{y} \sim \mathcal{N}(\mu, \sigma^2 I_n)$ .

How to estimate the mean  $\mu$  ?

## Example (Maximum likelihood solution)

Solve

$$\hat{\mu} = \operatorname{argmax}_{\mu} \mathbb{P}(\mathbf{y}) \quad (1)$$

$$= \operatorname{argmax}_{\mu} \frac{\exp(-\frac{1}{2}\|\mathbf{y} - \mu\|^2)}{(2\pi)^{\frac{n}{2}}} \quad (2)$$

$$= \mathbf{y} \quad (3)$$

# Introduction

## Gaussian sequence model

Observe one sample  $\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ ,  $\mathbf{y} \sim \mathcal{N}(\mu, \sigma^2 I_n)$ .

How to estimate the mean  $\mu$  ?

## Example (Maximum likelihood solution)

$$\hat{\mu} = \mathbf{y}$$

## How good it is ?

Mean square error  $\mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\mu}(\mathbf{y}) - \mu\|^2]$

# Introduction

## Gaussian sequence model

Observe one sample  $\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ ,  $\mathbf{y} \sim \mathcal{N}(\boldsymbol{\mu}, \sigma^2 I_n)$ .

How to estimate the mean  $\boldsymbol{\mu}$  ?

## Example (Maximum likelihood solution)

$$\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} = \mathbf{y}$$

## How good it is ?

Mean square error  $\mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}}(\mathbf{y}) - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2]$

## Definition (Admissible estimator)

$\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}}(\mathbf{y})$  is not admissible if there exists  $\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}}^*(\mathbf{y})$  such that

$\forall \boldsymbol{\mu} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ ,  $\mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}}(\mathbf{y}) - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2] \geq \mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}}^*(\mathbf{y}) - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2]$  (inequality strict for at least one value of  $\boldsymbol{\mu}$ )

# Introduction

## Introduction

Observe one sample  $\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ ,  $\mathbf{y} \sim \mathcal{N}(\mu, \sigma^2 I_n)$ .

How to estimate the mean  $\mu$  ?

## Example (Maximum likelihood solution)

$$\hat{\mu} = \mathbf{y}$$

## Definition (Admissible estimator)

$\hat{\mu}(\mathbf{y})$  is not admissible if there exists  $\hat{\mu}^*(\mathbf{y})$  such that

$\forall \mu \in \mathbb{R}^n$ ,  $\mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\mu}(\mathbf{y}) - \mu\|^2] \geq \mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\mu}^*(\mathbf{y}) - \mu\|^2]$  (inequality strict for at least one value of  $\mu$ )

Main result: The maximum likelihood solution is not admissible

# Some estimators of the form $\hat{\mu} = Ay$

$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} \sim \mathcal{N}(\mu, \sigma^2 I_n)$

**Shrinkage by a multiplicative constant**

Take  $\hat{\mu}_s = s\mathbf{y}$  with  $s \in [0, 1]$ .

# Some estimators of the form $\hat{\mu} = A\mathbf{y}$

$$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} \sim \mathcal{N}(\boldsymbol{\mu}, \sigma^2 I_n)$$

**Shrinkage by a multiplicative constant**

Take  $\hat{\mu}_s = s\mathbf{y}$  with  $s \in [0, 1]$ .

$$\mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\mu}_s - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2]$$

# Some estimators of the form $\hat{\mu} = Ay$

$$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} \sim \mathcal{N}(\boldsymbol{\mu}, \sigma^2 I_n)$$

**Shrinkage by a multiplicative constant**

Take  $\hat{\mu}_s = s\mathbf{y}$  with  $s \in [0, 1]$ .

$$\mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\mu}_s - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2] = \mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\mu}_s - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2] \quad (4)$$

# Some estimators of the form $\hat{\mu} = A\mathbf{y}$

$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} \sim \mathcal{N}(\boldsymbol{\mu}, \sigma^2 I_n)$

**Shrinkage by a multiplicative constant**

Take  $\hat{\mu}_s = s\mathbf{y}$  with  $s \in [0, 1]$ .

$$\mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\mu}_s - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2] = \mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\mu}_s - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2] \quad (4)$$

$$= \|\mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\hat{\mu}_s] - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2 + \mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\mu}_s - \mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\hat{\mu}_s]\|^2] \quad (5)$$

# Some estimators of the form $\hat{\mu} = A\mathbf{y}$

$$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} \sim \mathcal{N}(\boldsymbol{\mu}, \sigma^2 I_n)$$

**Shrinkage by a multiplicative constant**

Take  $\hat{\mu}_s = s\mathbf{y}$  with  $s \in [0, 1]$ .

$$\mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\mu}_s - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2] = \mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\mu}_s - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2] \quad (4)$$

$$= \|\mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\hat{\mu}_s] - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2 + \mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\mu}_s - \mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\hat{\mu}_s]\|^2] \quad (5)$$

$$= (s - 1)^2 \|\boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2 + s^2 n \sigma^2 \quad (6)$$

# Some estimators of the form $\hat{\mu} = A\mathbf{y}$

$$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} \sim \mathcal{N}(\boldsymbol{\mu}, \sigma^2 I_n)$$

**Shrinkage by a multiplicative constant**

Take  $\hat{\mu}_s = s\mathbf{y}$  with  $s \in [0, 1]$ .

$$\mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\mu}_s - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2] = \mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\mu}_s - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2] \quad (4)$$

$$= \|\mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\hat{\mu}_s] - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2 + \mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\mu}_s - \mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\hat{\mu}_s]\|^2] \quad (5)$$

$$= (s - 1)^2 \|\boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2 + s^2 n \sigma^2 \quad (6)$$

Taking  $s = \operatorname{argmin}_s \mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\mu}_s - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2]$  we get  $s = \frac{1}{1+n\sigma^2/\|\boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2} < 1$

# Some estimators of the form $\hat{\mu} = A\mathbf{y}$

$$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} \sim \mathcal{N}(\boldsymbol{\mu}, \sigma^2 I_n)$$

**Shrinkage by a multiplicative constant**

Take  $\hat{\mu}_s = s\mathbf{y}$  with  $s \in [0, 1]$ .

$$\mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\mu}_s - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2] = \mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\mu}_s - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2] \quad (4)$$

$$= \|\mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\hat{\mu}_s] - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2 + \mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\mu}_s - \mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\hat{\mu}_s]\|^2] \quad (5)$$

$$= (s - 1)^2 \|\boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2 + s^2 n \sigma^2 \quad (6)$$

Taking  $s = \operatorname{argmin}_s \mathbb{E}_{\mathbf{y}}[\|\hat{\mu}_s - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2]$  we get  $s = \frac{1}{1+n\sigma^2/\|\boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2} < 1$

**Problem** We don't know  $\boldsymbol{\mu}$

# Some estimators of the form $\hat{\mu} = A\mathbf{y}$

$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} \sim \mathcal{N}(\mu, \sigma^2 I_n)$

$n$  = number of samples

We observe  $y_1, \dots, y_n, y_i \in \mathbb{R}$

$N_k(i) = k$ -closest neighbors of  $i$ .

## Nearest neighbors

Take  $\hat{\mu}_i = \frac{1}{k} \sum_{l \in N_k(i)} y_l$

$$\hat{\mu} = A\mathbf{y}$$

where

$$A_{il} = \begin{cases} \frac{1}{k} & \text{if } l \in N_k(i) \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

# Some estimators of the form $\hat{\mu} = A\mathbf{y}$

**Exercice**  
Ridge solves

$$\hat{\beta} = \underset{\beta}{\operatorname{argmin}} \|X\beta - \mathbf{y}\|^2 + \lambda \|\beta\|^2 \quad (7)$$

1. Prove that  $X\hat{\beta} = A_{ridge}(\lambda)\mathbf{y}$ .
2. Assume we observe one sample  $\mathbf{y} = X\beta^* + \epsilon$  with  $\epsilon \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma^2 I_n)$ . What is the link with the Gaussian sequence model ?

# Bias variance decomposition for linear estimators

$$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} = \boldsymbol{\mu} + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}$$

$$\boldsymbol{\epsilon} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma^2 I_n)$$

Take an estimator of the form  $\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} = A\mathbf{y}$  ( $A$  deterministic)

# Bias variance decomposition for linear estimators

$$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} = \boldsymbol{\mu} + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}$$

$$\boldsymbol{\epsilon} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma^2 I_n)$$

Take an estimator of the form  $\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} = A\mathbf{y}$  ( $A$  deterministic)

$$\mathbb{E}[\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2]$$

# Bias variance decomposition for linear estimators

$$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} = \boldsymbol{\mu} + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}$$

$$\boldsymbol{\epsilon} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma^2 I_n)$$

Take an estimator of the form  $\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} = A\mathbf{y}$  ( $A$  deterministic)

$$\mathbb{E}[\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2] = \|\mathbb{E}[\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}}] - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2 + \mathbb{E}[\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \mathbb{E}[\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}}]\|^2] \quad (8)$$

# Bias variance decomposition for linear estimators

$$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} = \boldsymbol{\mu} + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}$$

$$\boldsymbol{\epsilon} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma^2 I_n)$$

Take an estimator of the form  $\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} = A\mathbf{y}$  ( $A$  deterministic)

$$\mathbb{E}[\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2] = \|\mathbb{E}[\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}}] - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2 + \mathbb{E}[\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \mathbb{E}[\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}}]\|^2] \quad (8)$$

$$= \|(A - I_n)\boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2 + \mathbb{E}[\|A\boldsymbol{\epsilon}\|^2] \quad (9)$$

# Bias variance decomposition for linear estimators

$$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} = \boldsymbol{\mu} + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}$$

$$\boldsymbol{\epsilon} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma^2 I_n)$$

Take an estimator of the form  $\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} = A\mathbf{y}$  ( $A$  deterministic)

$$\mathbb{E}[\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2] = \|\mathbb{E}[\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}}] - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2 + \mathbb{E}[\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \mathbb{E}[\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}}]\|^2] \quad (8)$$

$$= \|(A - I_n)\boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2 + \mathbb{E}[\|A\boldsymbol{\epsilon}\|^2] \quad (9)$$

$$= \|(A - I_n)\boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2 + \sigma^2 \text{tr}(A^\top A) \quad (10)$$

# Bias variance decomposition for linear estimators

$$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} = \boldsymbol{\mu} + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}$$

$$\boldsymbol{\epsilon} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma^2 I_n)$$

Take an estimator of the form  $\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} = A\mathbf{y}$  ( $A$  deterministic)

$$\mathbb{E}[\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2] = \|\mathbb{E}[\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}}] - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2 + \mathbb{E}[\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \mathbb{E}[\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}}]\|^2] \quad (8)$$

$$= \|(A - I_n)\boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2 + \mathbb{E}[\|A\boldsymbol{\epsilon}\|^2] \quad (9)$$

$$= \|(A - I_n)\boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2 + \sigma^2 \text{tr}(A^\top A) \quad (10)$$

**Problem** We don't know  $\boldsymbol{\mu}$

# Akaike Information Criterion

$$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} = \boldsymbol{\mu} + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}$$

$$\boldsymbol{\epsilon} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma^2 I_n)$$

$$\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} = A\mathbf{y}$$

## Theorem

$$\mathbb{E}[\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2] = \mathbb{E}[\hat{r}(A)]$$

$$\text{with } \hat{r}(A) = \|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \mathbf{y}\|^2 +$$

$$2\sigma^2 \text{tr}(A) - \sigma^2 n$$

# Akaike Information Criterion

$$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} = \boldsymbol{\mu} + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}$$

$$\boldsymbol{\epsilon} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma^2 I_n)$$

$$\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} = A\mathbf{y}$$

## Theorem

$$\mathbb{E}[\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2] = \mathbb{E}[\hat{r}(A)]$$

$$\text{with } \hat{r}(A) = \|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \mathbf{y}\|^2 + 2\sigma^2 \text{tr}(A) - \sigma^2 n$$

**Proof.**  
We have

$$\begin{aligned}\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \mathbf{y}\|^2 &= \|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \boldsymbol{\mu} - \boldsymbol{\epsilon}\|^2 \\ &= \|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2 - 2\boldsymbol{\epsilon}^\top(\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \boldsymbol{\mu}) + \|\boldsymbol{\epsilon}\|^2\end{aligned}$$



# Akaike Information Criterion

$$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} = \boldsymbol{\mu} + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}$$
$$\boldsymbol{\epsilon} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma^2 I_n)$$

$$\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} = A\mathbf{y}$$

## Theorem

$$\mathbb{E}[\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2] = \mathbb{E}[\hat{r}(A)]$$

$$\text{with } \hat{r}(A) = \|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \mathbf{y}\|^2 + 2\sigma^2 \text{tr}(A) - \sigma^2 n$$

**Proof.**  
We have

$$\begin{aligned}\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \mathbf{y}\|^2 &= \|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \boldsymbol{\mu} - \boldsymbol{\epsilon}\|^2 \\ &= \|\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \boldsymbol{\mu}\|^2 - 2\boldsymbol{\epsilon}^\top(\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \boldsymbol{\mu}) + \|\boldsymbol{\epsilon}\|^2\end{aligned}$$

$$\mathbb{E}[\|\boldsymbol{\epsilon}\|^2] = \sigma^2 n$$

$$\begin{aligned}\mathbb{E}[\boldsymbol{\epsilon}^\top(\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} - \boldsymbol{\mu})] &= \mathbb{E}[\boldsymbol{\epsilon}^\top A\boldsymbol{\epsilon}] = \\ \text{tr}(A\mathbb{E}[\boldsymbol{\epsilon}\boldsymbol{\epsilon}^\top]) &= \sigma^2 \text{tr}(A)\end{aligned}$$

□

# Applications of Akaike information criterion

$$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} = \boldsymbol{\mu} + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}$$

$$\boldsymbol{\epsilon} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma^2 I_n)$$

$$\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}}_s = A_{ridge}(\lambda) \mathbf{y}$$

How should we choose  $\lambda$  ?

Take  $\lambda = \hat{\lambda} = \operatorname{argmin}_{\lambda} \hat{r}(A_{ridge}(\lambda))$

# Applications of Akaike information criterion

$$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} = \boldsymbol{\mu} + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}$$

$$\boldsymbol{\epsilon} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma^2 I_n)$$

$$\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}}_s = s\mathbf{y}$$

How should we choose  $s$  ?

Take  $s = \hat{s} = \operatorname{argmin}_s \hat{r}(sl)$

## Exercice

Find  $\hat{s}$

# Applications of Akaike information criterion

$$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} = \boldsymbol{\mu} + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}$$

$$\boldsymbol{\epsilon} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma^2 I_n)$$

$$\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}}_s = s\mathbf{y}$$

$$\text{Take } s = \hat{s} = \left(1 - \frac{\sigma^2 n}{\|\mathbf{y}\|^2}\right).$$

# Applications of Akaike information criterion

$$\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n, \mathbf{y} = \boldsymbol{\mu} + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}$$

$$\boldsymbol{\epsilon} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma^2 I_n)$$

$$\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}}_s = s\mathbf{y}$$

$$\text{Take } s = \hat{s} = \left(1 - \frac{\sigma^2 n}{\|\mathbf{y}\|^2}\right).$$

## What comes next ?

- Show that  $\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} = \left(1 - \frac{\sigma^2 n}{\|\mathbf{y}\|^2}\right)$  is a better estimator than MLE when  $n \geq 5$
- Show that  $\hat{\boldsymbol{\mu}} = \left(1 - \frac{\sigma^2(n-2)}{\|\mathbf{y}\|^2}\right)$  is a better estimator than MLE when  $n \geq 3$

# Take home message

## What we have done today

- Inadmissible estimator = there exists an estimator with a lower  $\mathbb{E}[\|\hat{\mu} - \mu\|^2]$  for all  $\mu$
- Take  $\hat{\mu} = A\mathbf{y}$
- Show  $\mathbb{E}[\|\hat{\mu} - \mu\|^2] = \mathbb{E}[\hat{r}(A)]$  for some computable  $\hat{r}$
- Take  $A = sl$  and compute  $\hat{s} = \operatorname{argmin}_s \hat{r}(sl)$